

INSTITUTE for ENGAGEMENT & NEGOTIATION Shaping Our World Together WILLIAM & MARY LAW SCHOOL VIRGINIA COASTAL POLICY CENTER





SMART SCALE Funding for Infrastructure Projects

November 29, 2018

Authors Madhavi Kulkarni Julie Phillips







Thank You to Our Funders

This RAFT product was created with funding from:

Virginia Environmental Endowment and Virginia Sea Grant

We are grateful to these funders for supporting various phases of The RAFT from 2015-Present.

Anonymous Environmental Resilience Institute at the University of Virginia National Fish and Wildlife Foundation National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration* School of Architecture at the University of Virginia Virginia Coastal Zone Management Program* Virginia Environmental Endowment Virginia Sea Grant Climate Adaptation and Resilience Program

For more information visit The RAFT website: raft.ien.virginia.edu

The views expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the U.S. Department of Commerce, NOAA, or any of its sub agencies. The views expressed in The RAFT's various products are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of any of the funders mentioned above.

^{**} The RAFT implementation on the Eastern Shore, Task #92.03 was funded, in part, by the Virginia Coastal Zone Management Program at the Department of Environmental Quality through Grant #NA17NOS4190152 of the U.S. Department of Commerce, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, under the Coastal Zone Management Act of 1972, as amended.

MEMORANDUM

То:	Elizabeth Andrews Director, Virginia Coastal Policy Center (VCPC)
	Angela King Assistant Director, VCPC
From:	Madhavi Kulkarni & Julie Phillips VCPC Practicum I Students William & Mary Law School
Date:	November 29, 2018
Subject:	SMART SCALE Funding for Infrastructure Projects

Introduction

Towns engaged in The RAFT project have expressed interest in learning more about ways to obtain funding for resilience projects involving roads. The morass of transportation funding in Virginia is complex, but the primary route of obtaining funding is the SMART SCALE program. SMART SCALE has only been in place for a few years. As a result, many localities may be unaware of how to best utilize this new program to obtain funding for resilience related projects. This memo will explain how the SMART SCALE program works and the extent to which it is an option for Eastern Shore localities.

SMART SCALE does not replace other ways of obtaining funding through VDOT, but acts as the primary source of funding. There may be situations in which going directly to VDOT will be more effective. In such cases, localities should reach out to their local VDOT Residency.¹ *See* Appendix B for a list of additional funding sources.

SMART SCALE is a partnership between the Virginia Department of Transportation (VDOT), the Virginia Department of Rail and Public Transportation (DRPT), and the Virginia Office of Intermodal Planning and Investment (OIPI).² Given limited tax revenue, the purpose of SMART SCALE is to choose the best investments to ensure that the most critical transportation needs of the Commonwealth are met.³ SMART SCALE was first adopted in 2015, but has undergone modification to reach its current form.⁴ Projects selected for SMART SCALE funding are included in the Six Year Improvement Program (SYIP).⁵ SMART SCALE uses a biennial

¹ *VDOT Offices: Residencies*, VDOT, <u>http://www.virginiadot.org/about_vdot/residencies.asp</u> (last visited Nov. 20, 2018).

² See SMART SCALE, <u>http://vasmartscale.org</u> (last visited Nov. 7, 2018).

³ VA. CODE ANN. § 33.2-214.1 (2017).

⁴ SMART SCALE, SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE 2-3 (2017).

⁵ *Id.* at 42.

application process, the most recent of which began in March 2018 and will be complete in December 2019. As such, the soonest that applications can be submitted will be the spring of 2020.

SMART SCALE Application Process

There are five primary steps in the SMART SCALE application process. Each of these will be discussed in turn:

- 1. Eligibility/Funding,
- 2. Project Application,
- 3. Project Screening,
- 4. Evaluation/Scoring, and
- 5. Prioritization/Programming.⁶
- 1. Eligibility & Funding

Projects can be submitted for consideration by counties and cities; towns that maintain their own infrastructure and can also get maintenance funding from VDOT under § 33.2-319; and regional entities such as, but not limited to, Metropolitan Planning Commissions and Planning District Commissions.⁷ Towns eligible for maintenance funding under § 33.2-319 include those towns with populations over 3,500, either based on the most recent U.S. Census or on sufficient evidence that show that the population has reached 3,500 since the last Census.⁸ The towns of Chase City, Elkton, Grottoes, Narrows, Perisburg, and Saltville are eligible for § 33.2-319 maintenance funding due to having maintained streets prior to June 30, 1985 under the former § 33.1-80.⁹ Altavista, Lebanon, and Wise are also eligible for § 33.2-319 maintenance funding due to decades-old agreements with VDOT and the Virginia General Assembly.¹⁰ Towns that do not meet the 3,500 person population threshold and are not otherwise included under § 33.2-319 cannot apply directly to SMART SCALE for project funding.¹¹ Instead, such localities need to go through their county or a regional entity.¹² The Commonwealth Transportation Board (CTB) can also submit up to two projects during each biennial cycle, as long as a majority of the CTB votes in support of the submissions.¹³

However, being eligible to submit projects for consideration does not provide the above entities with *carte blanche*, as each of them has limitations on the applications they can submit.¹⁴ First, applications must relate to projects that are within the boundaries of the applying entity, although it is possible for joint applications to be submitted.¹⁵ Second, there are limits on the types

- ¹² *Id*.
- ¹³ Id.
- 14 *Id*.
- ¹⁵ Id.

⁶ About, SMART SCALE, <u>http://vasmartscale.org/about/default.asp</u> (last visited Nov. 7, 2018).

⁷ Id.

⁸ VA. CODE ANN. § 33.2-319(A) (2017).

⁹ *Id.*

 $^{^{10}}$ *Id*.

¹¹ About, supra note 6.

of projects that each type of entity can submit. Regional entities can submit projects for corridors of statewide significance and for regional networks, but not for urban development areas or for safety.¹⁶ Localities can apply for projects relating to corridors of statewide significance, as long as they have the support of a regional entity.¹⁷ Localities can also submit applications for regional network projects, urban development area projects, and safety projects, as long as the relevant Metropolitan Planning Commission gives support.¹⁸ Third, there are also limits on the number of applications each type of entity can submit per biennial application cycle.¹⁹ Localities with a population smaller than 200,000 and regional entities covering a population smaller than 500,000 can submit a maximum of four applications larger than 500,000 can submit a maximum of ten application cycle.²¹

The types of projects that are funded under SMART SCALE are those relating to capacity and operational improvements.²² This includes highway improvements, transit expansions, bicycle and pedestrian improvements, and transportation demand management.²³ Explicitly excluded from SMART SCALE funding are asset management projects. The SMART SCALE website specifically cites bridge repair and replacement, pavement repair and replacement, and guardrail replacement as examples of asset management that are not covered by SMART SCALE.²⁴ Other projects that are not eligible for SMART SCALE funding are stand-alone studies, projects that are already fully funded, and projects that are not contiguous, proximate, or of the same improvement type.²⁵

Funding for SMART SCALE projects comes from two sources: the High Priority Projects Program (HPPP) and the Construction District Grant Program (DGP).²⁶ HPPP funds are for projects relating to capacity issues on corridors of statewide significance and projects relating to capacity issues on regional networks, and the competition for these funds is commonwealth-

Significant Corridors, Office of Intermodal Planning & Investment,

- ¹⁷ Id.
- ¹⁸ *Id*.

 20 *Id*.

²² Id.

¹⁶ *Id.* A "Corridor of Statewide Significance" is a corridor that meets all of the following elements:

^{1. &}quot;Multiple modes and/or an extended freight corridor;

^{2.} Connection among regions, states, and/or major activity centers;

^{3.} High volume of travel; and

^{4.} Unique statewide function and/or fulfillment of statewide goal."

http://www.vtrans.org/significant_corridors.asp#what (last visited Nov. 29, 2018). ¹⁷ About, supra note 6.

¹⁹ Id.

²¹ *Id*.

 $^{^{23}}$ *Id*.

²⁴ Id.

²⁵ SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE, *supra*, at 12.

²⁶ About, supra.

wide.²⁷ DGP funds, on the other hand, can be used for projects relating to capacity issues on corridors of statewide significance, projects relating to capacity issues on regional networks, projects related to various improvements for urban development areas, and projects intended to provide improvements relating to safety.²⁸ Competition for DGP funds is limited to projects within each construction district.²⁹ It is possible to request funds from both HPPP and DGP, if a project is eligible under both.³⁰

It is also possible for entities to obtain funding from other sources to supplement SMART SCALE funds. These other sources include the Surface Transportation Block Grant Program (STBG), Revenue Sharing, Hampton Roads regional funding, State of Good Repair funding, and the Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP), among others.³¹ Brief explanations of these funding sources are included in Appendix B.

2. Project Application

There are two parts of the SMART SCALE application process.³² First is the preapplication, which contains information needed for the project screening and eligibility review.³³ Once the pre-application has been approved, the actual application itself needs to be filed.³⁴ This is a two-year application process.³⁵ The current timeline is as follows³⁶:

Schedule	Element of Application
Winter of Year 1	Early Coordination with DRPT and VDOT
March 1 of Year 1	Call for applications; Notification of
	estimated amount of available funding
March of Year 1 to May of Year 1	Submission of Basic Information

²⁷ Id.

 $^{^{28}}$ *Id*.

²⁹ *Id.* There are nine construction districts in Virginia: the Northern Virginia District, the Salem District, the Bristol District, the Staunton District, the Culpeper District, the Hampton Roads District, the Fredericksburg District, the Lynchburg District, and the Richmond District. *Location & Design Division*, VA. DEPT. OF TRANS.,

http://www.virginiadot.org/business/locdes/default.asp (last visited Nov. 29, 2018); VDOT Location & Design Division Organizational Chart, VA. DEPT. OF TRANS.,

http://www.virginiadot.org/business/resources/LocDes/Location_and_Design_Division.pdf (last visited Nov. 29, 2018).

³⁰ About, supra note 6.

³⁰ Id.

³¹ *Id*.

³² SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE, *supra* note 4, at 4-5.

³³ *Id.* at 4.

 $^{^{34}}$ *Id.* at 5.

³⁵ *Id.* at 1.

³⁶ *Id.* at 9; *About, supra* note 6.

³⁶ *Id*.

June 1 of Year 1	Deadline to submit pre-application: <i>no new</i> <i>applications will be allowed after June 1 of</i> <i>Year 1</i>
May of Year 1 to June of Year 1	Pre-Screening: VTrans and Eligibility
June of Year 1 to July 30 of Year 1	Application Refinement
August 1 of Year 1	Application Submission
August of Year 1 to December of Year 1	Measures Development and Scoring
January of Year 2	Release Evaluation of Projects and
	Recommended Funding Scenario
February of Year 2 to April of Year 2	CTB considers Evaluated Projects for
	inclusion in the Six Year Improvement
	Program (SYIP).
March of Year 2 to April of Year 2	Hold SYIP public meetings to gather input;
	release draft SYIP
June of Year 2	CTB adopts final SYIP
July of Year 2 to December of Year 2	Review lessons learned from prior rounds

As demonstrated by this timeline, the bulk of the work by the applying entity occurs prior to August 1 of Year 1, while the remainder of the time is devoted to evaluation and selection. This timeline also shows that SMART SCALE is not a quick process. SMART SCALE is not the best option for emergency funds, and in such cases the locality should reach out to VDOT directly.

The SMART SCALE Technical Guide recommends that applicants complete the following tasks to give their applications the best chance of success:

- "Reach out to VDOT, DRPT, and OIPI staff early in the process"
- "Complete a Pre-Application between March and May (no new applications may be created after June 1)"
- "Ensure project meets a VTrans need"
- "Ensure project and applicant eligibility requirements have been met"
- "Ensure project readiness requirements have been met"
- "Ensure project is properly defined in terms of scope, schedule, and cost estimate"
- "Submit a completed application by August 1, preferably earlier"³⁷

This list can serve as a checklist for entities who want to submit an application through SMART SCALE. However, it is important to note that just meeting these requirements does not guarantee SMART SCALE funding. The evaluation process, which is discussed in more detail below, is where selections are made. However, ensuring that all of the application requirements are met gives applicants a better chance at securing funding.

SMART SCALE has provided a worksheet that applying entities should use to structure their pre-application.³⁸ The components identified in the pre-application worksheet are general

³⁷ SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE, *supra* note 4, at 5.

³⁸ VA. DEPT. OF TRANS. & VA. DEPT. OF RAIL & PUB. TRANS., HB2 PRE-APPLICATION COORDINATION FORM 1 (2017). This worksheet is available at http://vasmartscale.org/resources/default.asp.

information about the project, identification of the VTrans need that the project meets, descriptions of the features of the project, descriptions of project factors that benefit the Commonwealth, details about scheduling and costs, information about who will design the project, and explanations of committed and requested funding.³⁹ There are also required documents that must be attached to the pre-application: a Project Improvement Sketch, a Resolution of Support from the Responsible Regional Entity, a Resolution of Support from a Relevant Entity, a Detailed Project Cost Estimate, a Local Comprehensive Plan (if applicable), a Local/Regional Economic Development Strategy (if applicable), and a document detailing Site Development References per Economic Development Responses (if applicable).⁴⁰ If the roadway in question is not maintained by VDOT, details on traffic volume are also required.⁴¹

The pre-application worksheet also serves as a way for applying entities to figure out concrete details of the project, as well as to determine if their project is eligible for SMART SCALE funding in the first place. Going through the pre-application process can help applying entities decide if the SMART SCALE application is worth their time and effort.

3. Project Screening

Each project funded by SMART SCALE must fulfill a need that has been identified in VTrans.⁴² VTrans has two component parts: the VTrans Vision 2040 and the Virginia Multimodal Transportation Plan (VMTP) Needs Assessment.⁴³

The VTrans Vision 2040 document has split the Commonwealth's transportation needs into guiding principles, goals, and objectives, each of which gets progressively narrower.⁴⁴ VTrans explains that the guiding principles are considered in each goal and each objective.⁴⁵ The guiding principles are:

- Guiding Principle 1: Optimize Return on Investments
- Guiding Principle 2: Ensure Safety, Security, & Resiliency
- Guiding Principle 3: Efficiently Deliver Programs
- Guiding Principle 4: Consider Operational Improvements and Demand Management First
- Guiding Principle 5: Ensure Transparency & Accountability and Promote Performance Management
- Guiding Principle 6: Improve Coordination Between Transportation & Land Use
- Guiding Principle 7: Ensure Efficient Intermodal Connections⁴⁶

⁴⁵ *Id.* at 33.

³⁹ *Id.* at 1-10.

⁴⁰ *Id.* at 11.

⁴¹ *Id.* at 12.

⁴² *Id.* at 13.

⁴³ *Id.*; VTrans, <u>http://www.vtrans.org</u> (last visited Nov. 7, 2018).

⁴⁴ VA. OFFICE OF INTERMODAL PLANNING & INV., VTRANS 2040 VISION PLAN 32 (2015).

⁴⁶ *Id*.

The goals and objectives are intertwined, with each goal including objectives that provide details of ways to meet the goals.⁴⁷ The goals and objectives are:⁴⁸

- Goal A: Economic Competitiveness & Prosperity
 - Objective A1: Reduce the amount of travel that occurs in severe congestion
 - Objective A2: Reduce the number and severity of freight bottlenecks
 - Objective A3: Improve reliability on key corridors for all modes
- Goal B: Accessible & Connected Places
 - Objective B1: Reduce average peak-period travel times in metropolitan areas
 - Objective B2: Reduce average daily trip lengths in metropolitan areas
 - Objective B3: Increase the accessibility to jobs via transit, walking, and driving in metropolitan areas
- Goal C: Safety for All Users
 - Objective C1: Reduce number and rate of motorized fatalities and severe injuries
 - Objective C2: Reduce the number and rate of non-motorized fatalities and severe injuries
- Goal D: Proactive System Management
 - Objective D1: Improve the condition of bridges based on deck area
 - Objective D2: Increase the lane miles of pavement in good or fair condition
 - Objective D3: Increase the percent of transit vehicles and facilities in good or fair condition
- Goal E: Healthy & Sustainable Communities
 - Objective E1: Reduce per-capita vehicle miles traveled
 - Objective E2: Reduce transportation related NOx, VOC, PM, and CO emissions
 - Objective E3: Increase number of trips traveled by active transportation (bicycling and walking)

As demonstrated by the guiding principles, goals, and objectives, resilience to flooding does not fit obviously into the VTrans 2040 Vision Plan. However, arguments can definitely be made under Guiding Principle 2 and Goal E. Guiding Principle 2 references "safety, security, and resiliency."⁴⁹ Efforts relating to reduced road flooding are clearly related to improving the safety of the roads, the security of travelers, and the resiliency of communities. While the Objectives under Goal E focus on air quality, Goal E itself promotes "healthy & sustainable communities."⁵⁰ In order for communities to be sustainable, there needs to be a reduction in flooding events on roadways.

Also, SMART SCALE consistently references VTrans "needs."⁵¹ While the emphasis in the VTrans 2040 Vision Plan is on the guiding principles, goals, and objectives, the Vision Plan

⁵⁰ *Id.* at 37.

⁴⁷ *Id.* at 35.

⁴⁸ *Id.* at 35-37.

⁴⁹ *Id.* at 33.

⁵¹ SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE, *supra* note 4, at 5, 18-19.

does also note several "needs."⁵² Specifically, the Vision Plan states "Virginia needs to . . . respond to the growing maintenance impacts of climate volatility and the aging transportation infrastructure by making investments that are sustainable and resilient."⁵³ It is not clear the weight given to this aspect of the Vision Plan as compared to the more explicitly stated guiding principles, goals, and objectives, but applicants could argue that this language provides VTrans support for flood resilience, particularly since the SMART SCALE application materials do not differentiate between general needs and the explicit guiding principles, goals, and objectives.

The VTrans Needs Assessment, which is distinct from the VTrans 2040 Vision Plan, also needs to be considered.⁵⁴ The VTrans Needs Assessment divides the Commonwealth's transportation needs into four categories: Corridor of Statewide Significance (CoSS); Regional Networks (RN); Urban Development Areas (UDA); and Transportation Safety Needs.⁵⁵ The project application needs to identify the CoSS segment, RN, UDA, and/or specific Safety Need that the project addresses, in addition to explaining how the project addresses the specified need. *Id.* The next VTrans Needs Assessment will be published in 2019.⁵⁶

The only time that flooding is taken into account is in regards to how historical flooding levels have affected travel time. *Id.* at 37-39. However, that does not help very much with resilience-focused projects. Only past flooding is taken into account, so there is no consideration paid to rising sea levels. Also, the only element of flooding taken into account is the extent to which it disrupts traffic. Furthermore, the travel time element is only 20% of the economic development prong, which is only 35% of the calculation.

4. Evaluation & Scoring

Once a proposed project has been confirmed as meeting a VTrans need and being a valid project under SMART SCALE, the next step in the selection process is evaluation and scoring. *About, supra*. Every potential project is assigned to a scoring evaluation team, which evaluates the project under six factors:

- safety (50% weight to equivalent property damage only (EPDO) of fatal and injury crashes, 50% weight to EPDO rate of fatal and injury crashes),
- congestion mitigation (50% weight to person throughput, 50% weight to person hours of delay),
- accessibility (60% weight to access to jobs, 20% weight to access to jobs for disadvantaged persons, 20% weight to access to multimodal choices),
- environmental quality (50% weight to air quality and environmental effect, 50% weight to impact to natural and cultural resources),
- economic development (60% weight to project support for economic development, 20% weight to intermodal access and efficiency, 20% weight to travel time reliability), and

⁵² VTRANS 2040 VISION PLAN, *supra* note 44, at 4.

⁵³ *Id*.

⁵⁴ SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE, *supra* note 4, at 18.

⁵⁵ Id.

⁵⁶ *Id.* at 18-19.

• land use (70% weight to transportation-efficient land use, 30% weight to increase in transportation-efficient land use). ⁵⁷

These factors are then weighted together, using different weighting formulas depending on each region's needs.⁵⁸ Regions are designated as Category A, Category B, Category C, and Category D. The communities in question, namely those within the Accomack-Northampton PDC, are Category D communities.⁵⁹ This means the factors will be weighted as follows:

- 10% to congestion mitigation
- 35% to economic development
- 15% to accessibility
- 30% to safety
- 10% to environmental quality.⁶⁰

No weight is given to land use in Category D communities because of their size and population.⁶¹

Once the six factors are weighed, the evaluation process moves on to the internal/external quality assurance and quality control (QA/QC) review.⁶² This stage is primarily to ensure that the process and methodology used to analyze the projects and to weight the six factors are fair.⁶³

Project cost is also considered during the evaluation stage. SMART SCALE requires a cost-benefit analysis.⁶⁴ The SMART SCALE score is based on this cost-benefit analysis, though it only takes into account the cost that would come from SMART SCALE, not other sources.⁶⁵ The purpose of limiting the cost considered in the cost-benefit analysis is to encourage applicants to seek out other sources of funding that can bolster their project.⁶⁶

The score given is calculated by dividing the Project Benefit by the amount of funds requested from SMART SCALE.⁶⁷ The Project Benefit is the sum of the Weighted Factor Values, which is calculated by multiplying the Factor Value by the factor weights based on the Category.⁶⁸ The Factor Value is the sum of the Weighted Normalized Measure Values within each factor area, and the Weighted Normalized Measure Value is the Normalized Measure Values multiplied by measure weights.⁶⁹ The Normalized Measure Value is a numerical value that is given to each measure, determined by the Measure Value as a percentage of the maximum Measure Value.⁷⁰

⁶¹ Id.

 63 *Id*.

- ⁶⁵ Id.
- ⁶⁶ Id.
- ⁶⁷ *Id.* at 37.
- 68 *Id*.
- ⁶⁹ Id. ⁷⁰ Id.

⁵⁷ Id.

⁵⁸ Id.

⁵⁹ SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE, *supra* note 4, at 35.

⁶⁰ About, supra.

⁶² SMART SCALE TECHNICAL GUIDE, *supra* note 4, at 33.

⁶⁴ *Id.* at 36.

Measure Value is defined as the data calculated that describes the project characteristics.⁷¹ The methodology for calculating the SMART SCALE score for a project is as follows⁷²:

- 1. For each measure in each factor, the highest Measure Value is determined and is given a value of 100%. The Normalized Measure Value is established by comparing the other Measure Values to the highest Measure Value and then taking the project Measure Value as a percentage of the highest Measure Value.
- 2. Measure weights are applied to determine Weighted Normalized Measure Values, which are then added to calculate the Factor Value.
- 3. The Factor Value is multiplied by the weighting percentage for each factor. The Weighted Factor Values are then added to obtain the Project Benefit.
- 4. The Project Benefit is divided by the SMART SCALE funded cost of the project in tens of millions of dollars.

The SMART SCALE score is calculated using a complex methodology.⁷³ The Technical Guide provides a hypothetical series of figures and runs them through the methodology (not with the Category D percentages) to obtain a SMART SCALE score of 1.43:⁷⁴

Factor	Conge Mitiga		Safety		Accessibility		Economic Development		Environment		Land Use			
Measure	Increase in Peak Period Person throughput	Reduction in Peak Period Delay	Reduction in Fatal & Injury Crashes	Reduction in Fatal & Injury Crash Rate	Increase in Access to Jobs	Increase in Access to Jobs for Disadvantaged Populations	Increase in Access to Travel Choices	Square Feet of Commercial or Industrial Development Supported	Tons of Goods Impacted	Improvement in Travel Time Reliability	Potential to Improve Air Quality	Other Factor Values Scaled by Potential Acres Impacted	Future Transportation and Efficient Land Use	Increase in Transportation Efficient Land Use
Measure Value	12.5 Pers.	17.3 Pers. Hrs	.4 EPDO	124.1 EPDO/ 100M VMT	1815.6 jobs/ person	1392.5 jobs/ person	2237.9 adj. users	28,995 adj. sq. ft. (000s)	1257.2 adj. daily	11.8 adj. buffer	1826.7 adj. points	.5 scaled points	16,004.3 access pop./	6815.1 access pop./ emp.

⁷¹ Id.

⁷² *Id.* at 37-39.

⁷³ *See id.* at 37-39.

⁷⁴ *Id.* at 40.

									tons (000s)	time index			emp. density	density change
Normalize d Measure Value (0- 100)	1.4	0.8	6.9	1.2	0.2	0.2	0.2	2.1	2.8	3.8	0.1	0.4	5.4	2.3
Measure Weight (% of Factor)	50%	50 %	50%	50%	60%	20%	20%	60%	20%	20%	50%	50%	70%	30%
Factor Value	1.	1	4.1		0.2			2.6			0.3		4.5	
Factor Weight (% of Project Score)	45	%	5%		15%		5%		10%		20%			
Weighted Factor Value	0.	5	0.	.2	0.03			0.13			0.03		0.89	
Project Benefit	1.78													
SMART SCALE Cost		\$12,400,000												
Score		1.43												

5. Prioritization & Programming

The CTB uses the SMART SCALE scores for eligible projects to determine which projects will be granted SMART SCALE funding. *Id.* at 42. The CTB publishes their decisions in the draft Six-Year Improvement Program (SYIP). *Id.* The SYIP is available for public comment for several months before the final SYIP is formally adopted. *Id.* CTB has a statutory obligation to adopt an SYIP each year, despite the fact that SMART SCALE only happens every other year. *Id.*

Conclusion

As is often repeated on the SMART SCALE website, there is a limited amount of tax revenue to be invested in the Commonwealth's roads. This means that the competition for funding is fierce. Given the emphases on congestion and economic development in the funding formula, it seems likely that more populated regions of Virginia will be more competitive in the SMART SCALE selection process. Realistically, this means that small communities in rural areas are going to struggle to get funding. However, that does not mean SMART SCALE should be disregarded as a funding opportunity. For eligible projects, it serves as an option for getting funding for resilience-related projects. Also, the struggle for funding exists for all sources of state funding, so it is logical to pursue as many chances for funding as reasonably possible.

For any community that is interested in obtaining funding for resilience-focused infrastructure projects, the best recommendation is to maintain communication with the local

VDOT residency. VDOT is in the best position to advise localities on what options will work best for each locality's specific needs and goals.

Appendix A: Index of SMART SCALE RESOURCES

SMART	http://vasmartscale.org/documents/2018documents/ss technical guide nov13 2017 revised feb2018 for posting.pdf
. –	
SCALE	
Technical	
Guide	
SMART	http://vasmartscale.org/default.asp
SCALE	
Website	
VTrans 2040	http://vtrans.org/vtrans2040.asp
Vision Plan	
VTrans	http://vtrans.org/vtrans2040.asp
Needs	
Assessment	
Pre-	http://vasmartscale.org/documents/2018documents/2018_smart_scale_pre-
Application	application_coordination_form_help_guide.docx
Coordination	
Form Help	
Guide	
SMART	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=omUmTX4Hb8Q&feature=youtu.be
SCALE Pre-	
Application	
Training	

Appendix B: Other Potential Funding Sources

The following sources are potential options for resilience related infrastructure measures. It is not an exhaustive list, but is provided to give a sense of less well known options that exist. The list is organized in alphabetical order.

I. Accomack-Northampton Planning District Commission

While the A-NPDC website is not clear on sources of funding, getting projects included in the next Eastern Shore of Virginia Rural Long Range Transportation Plan would likely help bring attention to projects.

Contact info: (757) 787-2936

http://www.a-npdc.org/accomack-northampton-planning-districtcommission/transportation-planning/plans-projects/

II. Hampton Roads Transportation Fund

The Hampton Roads Transportation Planning Organization has funding for transportation improvements in Hampton Roads. As a local transportation body, HRTPO will have less competition for funds in comparison to a state body. In order to get funding, the first step is to get included in the HRTPO's Long-Range Transportation Plan. The second step is to be included in the HRTPO's Transportation Improvement Program, which is regularly updated.

Contact info: (757) 420-8300

https://www.hrtpo.org/page/hampton-roads-transportation-fund/

III. Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP)

The primary purpose for the HSIP is to reduce traffic fatalities and serious injuries. While this does not mesh entirely with resilience efforts, it may be an option for any improvements that relate to high-risk flooding on roads.

Contact info: karen.scurry@dot.gov

https://safety.fhwa.dot.gov/hsip/

IV. Revenue Sharing Program

Run by VDOT, the Revenue Sharing Program is a way for localities to obtain additional funding for projects. Under this program, locality funds are matched with state funds. Not all projects are eligible, however.

Contact info: (804) 786-2746

http://www.virginiadot.org/business/local-assistance-access-programs.asp

V. State of Good Repair

State of Good Repair is a VDOT program to provide funding for "deteriorated pavements and structurally deficient bridges." Applications from localities must be submitted between Nov. 1 2018 and Jan. 7, 2019.

Contact info: stateofgoodrepair@vdot.virginia.gov

http://www.virginiadot.org/projects/state of good repair.asp

VI. Surface Transportation Block Grant Program (STBG)

The STBG Program is a federal source of funding to improve conditions for surface transportation infrastructure. This program specifically lists environmental improvements as eligible projects. However, this program does require going through the state, rather than the locality applying directly.

Contact info: <u>david.bartz@dot.gov</u> EnhancementProgram@VDOT.Virginia.gov

https://www.fhwa.dot.gov/specialfunding/stp/

http://www.virginiadot.org/business/prenhancegrants.asp